



A Publication of the East Texas Historical Association

Volume 53 Issue 2

Article 5

2015

"Well, Bless Your Heart!": Rhetoric and Power in Dallas Women During the Progressive Era

Emily Clark

Patricia Gower

The East Texas Historical Journal is a publication of the East Texas Historical Association (ETHA). The ETHA is a membership organization founded in 1962 to support research into the unique histories of East Texas and to educate and engage others in the effort.

More information about the ETHA is available at www.easttexashistorical.org

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.sfasu.edu/ethj

Part of the United States History Commons Tell us how this article helped you.

Provide feedback to ETHA.

Recommended Citation

Clark, Emily and Gower, Patricia (2015) ""Well, Bless Your Heart!": Rhetoric and Power in Dallas Women During the Progressive Era," *East Texas Historical Journal*: Vol. 53: Iss. 2, Article 5. Available at: https://scholarworks.sfasu.edu/ethj/vol53/iss2/5

This Article has been accepted for inclusion in the East Texas Historical Journal by an authorized editor of ETHA and SFA. This Article is brought to you free and open access by the Journals at SFA ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact cdsscholarworks@sfasu.edu.

"Well, Bless Your Heart!": Rhetoric and Power in Dallas Women During the Progressive Era

By Emily Clark and Patricia Gower

"A good club woman...is a woman imbued with a noble purpose of exalting humanity, beautifying and making happier her home, of becoming a comrade and coadjutor to her husband and a guardian angel to her children."

As the nineteenth century came to a close, middle-class anxieties surrounding the growth and disorder of cities continued to grow stronger. Many of the ills evident in urban life became the focus of both religious and secular organizations. Poverty, prostitution, illiteracy, epidemics, and urban corruption all emerged as targets for reformers of many persuasions. Particularly in the South, religious rhetoric still resonated strongly in most communities and could be employed to motivate philanthropic endeavors. In an effort to gain the support of the religious community, reforming organizations often couched their rhetoric in terms of moral uplift and rejuvenation of the urban life, including women's clubs and female journalists. Writing under the name "Grace Greenwood," Sara Clarke Lippencott commented in the *New York Times*:

I have been sharply rebuked by my brothers, as an indiscreet sister-"speaking out in meeting," and revealing the secrets of the vestry, the deacons, the elders, and holy men generally. I have been roughly reminded that I was a woman, and told that I ought to be sternly remanded by public opinion to women's proper sphere, where the eternal unbaked pudding and the immemorial unattached shirt-button await my attention.^{<1>2}

Emily Clark is an Associate Professor of History at The University of Incarnate Word. Patricia Gower is a Professor of History at The University of Incarnate Word Lippincott used the religious and gendered rhetoric imposed upon women after the Civil War to underscore the gap between women's and men's participation in public life.^{<?>3}

Lippincott's acerbic description of the censoring of women activists demonstrates the early and common argument that women, the "angels of the house," logically needed to be involved in the "housekeeping" of society. The middle-class drives to dominate municipal politics, the extension of public services, debates over public ownership or regulation of utilities, and campaigns to improve the appearance of cities were all characterized as struggles against moral decay as well as corruption and vice.

After the end of the Civil War, women slowly began to participate in public affairs, albeit in circumscribed and limited ways. Through increasing reliance on shopping as opposed to home production, women became constant and largely autonomous figures in the urban landscape. With the introduction of the department store and access to leisure time, middle-class women increasingly functioned as the main consumers and purchasers of goods for the home. While these women maintained all of the desirable traits of a "true woman," they also embraced social and economic changes which allowed them to move beyond the home, although in restricted circumstances. This increased presence in downtown areas acquainted many more women with the emerging problems of public spaces and encouraged them to enter the campaign for urban reforms.^{<>>5}

In addition to accessibility of public areas, education became more available to women after the Civil War. This education was usually tightly controlled and often simply aimed at producing potential mates for male students. One advocate of women's education announced that college education would produce models of "intelligent motherhood and properly subservient wifehood."^{<1>6} Education available to women often simply attempted to promulgate and reinforce the tenets of "True American Womanhood" that stressed home and child-raising as the proper spheres for women. In this framework, it was believed that women only sought education in order to establish successful families and raise a new virtuous generation. However, despite efforts to control women's access, women did achieve higher education in growing numbers. With this often came both increased awareness of problems and the increased desire to actively pursue reform. This shift began women's attempts to either rebel against or manipulate rhetoric

used to limit their involvement to the private sphere of the home.<?>7

By the 1890s, many more middle-class women became adept at manipulating this Cult of True Womanhood and the moral aspects of reform in order to enlarge their sphere of activities. They sought acceptable vehicles of public participation that would both defuse male resistance and sidestep societal prohibitions. One of the problems of women asserting their increased presence in the public world was the idea that respectable women functioning in the public space might be equated with prostitutes. Therefore, one acceptable avenue that offered acceptable public activity for women was social work. As a way of claiming their right to an increased place in public life, often from within the framework of church activities, women stressed the roles of ministering to the poor and other unfortunates. For example, as early as 1878, Methodist women in Texas began forming societies to support missionary activities as well as clubs for women.⁸

For many women, the road to social activism or participation began during their college education. College education, in its gender specific nature, often created a new sense of identification with other women and a new sense of feminine consciousness. This new consciousness helped middle-class women to identify problems specific to women even of different classes. Problems of child raising, alcoholism, proper nutrition, and brutal working conditions in the lives of poor women and children became increasingly recognized. As higher education became more acceptable, advanced degrees opened to women in growing numbers and more women sought employment after college. Most women found that using their new education was difficult and very limited. Many times, jobs in the teaching field were readily available with no requirements even for a bachelor's degree. As a result, many of the first generation of college-educated women sought new ways to become involved and maintain contact with each other. Social work emerged as an approved avenue for employment or voluntary activity, often sanctioned by churches. By incorporating ideals of womanhood as preservers of society's virtue and Christian tradition, women attempted to find new areas in which to use their education and talents.9

Middle-class women who did not go to college sought other ways to overcome isolation, improve their education and enter into a safe public space. Clubs, both literary and social, provided women with chances to speak in public while still struggling to retain their

traditional roles. Many of these women did not want to violate cultural norms or admit that their activism reflected real change. Women's clubs proved to be places where a broad range of women could participate at their comfort level. In 1868, Jane Croly organized the Sorosis Club, the first club expressly for women and also became to first historian of the club movement. In her history, she wrote clubs provided a source of companionship, education, literary study and reform activities despite male resistance.⁰

Women's clubs took several forms. Early on, many devoted themselves exclusively to serious literary endeavors with assigned reading and reports. Others concentrated on the study of history or specific authors. Often the reports and research papers became the first attempt of the frequently terrified women to speak in public. These forums became training arenas for middle-class women to address an audience in a way that was sheltered. In addition, speaking in front of other women did not usually directly threaten male prerogatives and thus often avoided the intense antagonism aroused by more public speeches.¹

Women in clubs often possessed little or no knowledge of the process of organization. Even missionary societies in churches were usually administered by men. In order to shape their new association, many clubs turned to the speech "How Can Women Best Associate?" by Julia Ward Howe and used it as a guidebook for organization. Some newspapers printed sample constitutions to provide a guide for women to work with. Like Jane Croly, most women were determined that the clubs should operate completely free from the influence, disapproval or manipulation of men. Therefore, the clubs copied each other and exchanged information on constitutions and procedure. Most clubs worked under well-developed constitutions and parliamentary procedure. In this way, the women in their clubs announced their serious intentions and protected themselves from accusations of frivolousness.²

Most clubs did not devote themselves exclusively to study for very long. Membership of clubs was drawn from predominantly middleclass, prosperous and conservative women of the commercial and social elite. Many believed that their access to "leisure came with responsibility."³ Many of these white, mainstream Protestant women felt deeply that their positions in society as the wives of prominent businessmen and politicians carried obligations to serve the

Vol. 53

community. However, these women generally remained uninterested in any kind of professional career and treasured their amateur status. Despite this, women's clubs became increasingly important in civic affairs in the 1890s.⁴

Several forces led women to concentrate on reform and social activism as opposed to literary study. As more women gained college educations, clubs for women could cease serving as surrogate alma maters and study became less central. In addition, clubs gained greater acceptance in male circles as middle-class men increasingly exploited the benefits of associations in order to carry out reforms. The shift to service also served to defuse criticism that some clubs occasionally encountered. Clubs founded as literary enterprises seemed to some to be selfish and self-absorbed enterprises for women and threatening to the sanctity of the home, although purely social clubs for men faced no such criticism. However, undertaking tasks of "municipal housekeeping" justified women's organizations to many critical of women taking time from homemaking for study or companionship. In fact, organizers of literary or study clubs often justified literary study by illustrating that reform was nourished by study and reflection. These kinds of rationalizations proved especially important in the South where resistance to public roles for women remained strongly entrenched for some time after gaining some acceptance in other areas.5

By the 1890s, Texas remained in many ways a southern frontier state. Women's clubs came later to the state than to more settled areas but soon flourished in both cities and small towns. There were a few early clubs such as Dallas's Pearl Street Reading Club, which was established by 1880, but the majority originated later. These usually copied the organization and focus of clubs from areas that had older and better established club traditions. Literary clubs served as the primary vehicles to introduce clubdom to Texans and like their sister organizations in other states, they strove for serious study and attention to parliamentary administration.⁶

Although Texas women came late to the club system, they began to shift to philanthropic and reforming efforts more quickly than those clubs in the Northeast. Once they began to claim their right to "municipal housekeeping," women throughout the United States stressed issues that fit into this category. The Women's Christian Temperance Union, which had already emerged as the earliest female

organization to gain widespread acceptance in the South, was the first group to move past their initial focus into other reforms. By 1890, the WCTU attacked many social problems from the eight hour work day for women to woman's suffrage. However, as women's clubs became more socially active, these organizations usually focused on issues that had more immediate impact on the lives of their cities. One of the earliest concerns became the building and equipping of public libraries. These institutions fit easily with the ideal of nurturing learning within literary clubs and with the image of women as Bearers of Culture. Many women's clubs began the drive to take advantage of the offer of Andrew Carnegie to endow libraries in cities and towns that proved willing to help raise the money to build and maintain a public library.⁷

The involvement of women in civic and political life required that they find indirect ways of entering the predominantly male conversation. This was accomplished by first manipulating existing gender rhetoric and ideology which restricted women to polite discussions about domestic concerns. However, as they gained a foothold in public housekeeping their reliance on feminine rhetoric lessened and they instead depended upon the power of their size.⁸

As clubs began to face the challenge of reforms, women realized that individual clubs usually failed to muster the needed support, both physically and financially. Women like Jane Croly recognized the need for larger organizations that could function nationwide in order to operate more efficiently. In 1890, Croly formed the General Federation of Women's Clubs as a national association to help women's clubs confront the problems of society. Federated association could avoid overlap and duplication and provide greater collective effort. Croly studied and used techniques polished by the WCTU to organize women into a powerful tool for reform.⁹ However, women were still conscious of the ways in which they navigated the "public" world: "in 1894, at its second meeting the Women's Congress changed its name to 'The State Council of Women of Texas.' The word 'congress' was 'too political,' they decided and they defined ambitious, if somewhat vague, purposes."⁰

State and local federations followed the establishment of the GFWC and copied its organization in order to streamline the reforming initiatives of the clubs. These associations formed a vast network that quickly spread news and helped form tightly knit and well coordinated efforts. The Texas Federation appeared in 1897 and by 1898 had set as

a primary goal the building of public libraries in Texas. Texas women had clearly claimed their rights to activism on behalf of municipal improvement.¹

In Dallas, 1898 proved to be an important year for women. Dallas became one of the first Texas cities to form a citywide federation of women's clubs. Dallas already had a vibrant club population and women had previously recognized the need for a public library. Under the leadership of the Dallas Shakespeare Club President May (Mrs. Henry) Exall, women from clubs such as the Pierian Club and Oak Cliff's Quatro Club agreed to pool their resources and work together to gain a library. These energetic women proved to be as determined in their pursuit of a goal as their husbands in business or politics. They decided to push the city into supporting their goal of a public library by raising the initial money and contacting Andrew Carnegie about their desire for a grant.²

The Federation formed the Dallas Public Library Association to carry out the library campaign. Their goal was to quickly raise \$12,000 to prove their determination and dedication to the project to Carnegie and also pressure the city to donate a site and pledge yearly maintenance. The *Dallas Morning News*, particularly on its woman's page, aided in their campaign. George Dealey began showing his commitment to civic improvement by throwing his weight behind the library drive. The clubwomen quickly raised \$10,000 in only two months. Impressed by their organization and accomplishments, Mayor John Traylor made the library a central issue of his Annual Report in 1899.³

The Commercial Club weighed in on the side of the women by announcing their admiration for their success in raising funds and by calling on the city to support the clubwomen's efforts. After the city agreed to donate a site and pledged \$4,000 a year for maintenance, Andrew Carnegie offered Dallas \$50,000 towards the construction of the library. Mayor Traylor quickly accepted and on 0ctober 30, 1901, the Carnegie Library opened with 10,000 volumes. Prominent women appeared regularly before the city council to report on acquisitions. In addition, at least two women were regularly appointed to the library's board of directors.⁴

Before the library even opened, women had become involved in other initiatives to improve the city. In the financial recovery of the late 1890s, boostering increased in Dallas and the drive for greater growth accelerated. Businessmen began to recognize in the women of Dallas natural allies in their struggle to improve the image of their city. In the successful 1903 Oak Cliff annexation drive, efforts were made to allay the fears of Oak Cliff women about the local option even though women could not vote in the election.⁵

In 1899, businessmen began a drive to make Dallas a more attractive place to live and work. Articles appeared in the *Morning News* highlighting the dirty condition of the city's streets and fouling of the Trinity River with "dead pigs floating and negroes fishing."⁶ Hoping to set a good example, the *DMN* placed waste cans outside their building. By May, the drive had gone beyond simple exhortation and example-setting. George Dealey and other businessmen established the Cleaner Dallas League with vice presidents in every ward to oversee cleaning of the streets and sidewalks. The influence of women and their interest in city affairs was recognized early when women were invited to join Cleaner Dallas and Dealey and the other organizers called for a woman vice president in each ward in addition to the male representative.⁷

Women became involved in other drives to make Dallas more livable and attractive. Their clubs bombarded city council with suggestions for ordinances to improve behavior of men in the name of sanitation and health. In 1902, a petition was submitted requesting an anti-expectoration ordinance. However, on September 24, when the council considered the ordinance, an amendment was attached that prevented the anti-spitting regulations from applying to public buildings if no cuspidors were provided. In 1908 and again in 1910, the Dallas Federation submitted another petition calling for an ordinance to prohibit chickens and ducks from running loose in Dallas streets⁸

The Texas Federation and the Dallas Federation also took up the issue of trying children in adult courts. The incident that galvanized them was the jailing of two youngsters for the theft of some thread. Working through male organizations such as the Texas Association of County Judges and Commissioners and the city council, the federation gathered information on new types of juvenile courts and detention homes. Their efforts finally came to fruition in 1907 when Texas established separate legal procedures for minors. The Dallas women also saw to the hiring of a juvenile probation officer by paying the salary for one until the city agreed to take over the appropriations.⁹

In 1906, the clubwomen pushed for improvements in the food and milk supply of Dallas and all of Texas. In the first pure food and drug act in the state, they succeeded in forcing the creation of a City Board

Vol. 53

of Health. Instrumental in this effort was the Dallas Forum, a new organization formed by the Federation and dedicated to pushing for changes to problems that fell under the aegis of women's concerns. On April 11, 1908, the women pushed the new commission to create a new office of City Chemist to help enforce pure food and drug ordinances. In 1907, with the Texas Federation the Dallas women called for the establishment of a state-wide Pure Food and Drug Bill recommending that a woman serve as Deputy Food Inspector.⁰

In March 1910, the DFWC came before the council again to present a petition to establish regulations and restrictions on motion pictures. Like women in other localities, the women in Dallas believed that movies were too suggestive. In February 1911, the council responded to this pressure and unanimously voted to create a board of Censors. They continued to hear reports from the Board for many years about the efforts to maintain the moral rectitude of Dallas citizens.¹

Women in Dallas also dedicated themselves to securing the services of a matron for the supervision of white female prisoners. The pressure for a police matron actually began in 1899 under the WCTU. In 1906, when the city council refused to hire a police matron, the Federation hired a matron and paid her salary until the city council agreed to take over the payments. They also hired a juvenile officer and paid the salary until the council admitted the usefulness of the position. They raised the money for these initiatives from the sales on Tag Day when women sold tags on downtown streets. The tags read "I have been tagged for the children of Dallas" and were bought by businessmen. On this first Tag Day, the women of Dallas raised \$4,121.35 for neglected and delinquent children and received full page coverage in the Morning News. In addition to Tag Days, the clubwomen developed other "feminine" tactics or venues like receptions and teas in order to raise funds and solicit support when they could not lobby or recruit using traditional methods reserved for men.²

Another issue of civic betterment that absorbed the energies of the Federation was the establishment of city parks with playgrounds and well-maintained and supervised equipment for the city's children. A long campaign began in 1908 to convince the city council to build city parks. The Forum had previously been involved in the pure food and drug effort and the juvenile court issue and now it worked to convince the city to hire a park superintendent as well as to improve school playgrounds and city parks. In 1909, with the proceeds of a Tag

Day, the women bought equipment for schools and purchases and equipped a city park. They met emphatic rejection by the council to their demand for a paid superintendent until they employed the bynow-familiar strategy of hiring and paying the salary of a supervisor. They paid the salary of the supervisor until the city agreed to pick up the tab.³

With increasing confidence in their abilities and in their right to supervise matters relating to children, the Dallas Federation allied with another strong group, the Dallas Congress of Mothers, to announce another initiative. With this effort they took at step that, while not unprecedented, pushed them farther onto the public stage than before. One of the areas claimed by women by virtue of their roles as mother and nuturer was supervision of children. In their eyes, this naturally involved supervision of children who were not simply juveniles in trouble or neglected children. Now, some women demanded a role in overseeing their children and their education.⁴

In 1908, they proclaimed the need for women to serve on local school boards. In the eyes of many women around the country, the solution to the problems of public schools lay in the election of women. Pauline Periwinkle, the Morning News women's columnist, wrote that women had more time than busy men to give to education. Schools suffered from lack of attention to safety and poor, unsuitable equipment and women stood ready to push for needed improvements. Periwinkle's argument concerning education extended to many of the issues spearheaded by the clubs. Elizabeth York Enstam chronicles the response by Sarah Elizabeth Weaver to complaints in the DMN by again suggesting that women possessed more time than men. However, Enstam also points out that "however circumspect [Weaver's] phrasing, the fact remained that women's solutions to social problems challenged the policies, political decisions, and concepts of government established by men."5 The apparent gap between the women's rhetoric and the results of their activism widened as their involvement and Periwinkle's agency increased, causing tension between the clubs and male politicians. After several articles and columns setting the stage by illustrating the positive aspects of women in public, Pauline Periwinkle announced that two women would run for the chance to sit on the Dallas City School Board in the next city election. Adella Turner, the wife of a prominent Dallas businessman, and Mrs. P. P. Tucker ran for two places on the school board.6

They faced the resistance of several men including the president of the school board. At the Jewish American Constitution Club, Victor J. Hexter, the president of the school board made a speech in which he dismissed the women's efforts at election. He did not take the approach of decrying women leaving the home for politics but instead, he stated that he did not want voters to be fooled. He did not believe that the race by the two women should be taken seriously because they had no chance or real reason to be running. However, other businessmen jumped in quickly to support the candidacy of the women. In its traditional manner of raising support, the Morning News carried many letters and columns with the announcements promoting the service of women on school boards. One article stated many believed that putting women in politics would lower the "standards of womanhood" and that women should maintain their purity by staying in the home and out of politics. Other articles then appeared illustrating that many businessmen believed that women could provide valuable service in support of children. Prominent businessmen lined up behind the paper's efforts to raise support and publicly announced their backing of women on the school board. The women, both mothers of four children, declared their determination to campaign in all areas of the city. However, they did not include black neighborhoods or areas with brothels in them in their campaign.7

As the election approached, drawings for position on the ballot took place. The top six vote-earners would win positions on the board and some believed that position near the top of the ballot increased a person's odds of winning. Sam Dealey, one of the candidates for school board, offered to let the women draw first and possibly get a top position on the ballot. He believed that the women faced some obstacles because of their late entry into the race. The women declined his offer and announced they did not want to be treated any differently than other candidates. Victor Hexter refused to run with the women, so supporters of their candidacy had to find others willing to run with them. When the election took place, the voting was very close. Victor Hexter was defeated for the presidency of the board by Mr. Johnson. The voting for the board was very tight and the last position was not determined until the last box was counted. Both women won but Mrs. Tucker defeated Col S. F. Moss by only 23 votes in very light turnout. Dallas had about 13,000 qualified voters and of this number, only about 6,500 turned out. The pattern of very few voters deciding important issues in Dallas continued as this election not only brought women to the school board but also saw the defeat of an effort to establish a municipal electric plant.⁸

In all of these drives for change, the Dallas clubwomen were aided by the sharp and humorous columnist of the *Dallas Morning News*, Pauline Periwinkle. Her real name was Isadore Sutherland Miner Callaway and she began shaping Dallas opinions as soon as she arrived in 1893. Hired by George Dealey, she came to Dallas by way of Michigan and Ohio. In Toledo, Ohio, she edited a magazine, *Good Healtb*, which she used as a vehicle for advocating rights for workers and women workers in particular. From the outset, she emerged as a powerful voice on a wide range of issues. She served as president of the Dallas Federation, spoke for woman's suffrage and helped spearhead many of the civic campaigns undertaken by clubwomen.⁹

One of her earliest campaigns was the establishment of the Texas Woman's Press Association and she also worked to unite women's groups in Dallas. By 1896, she became the first women's editor for the Morning News, and then began a weekly page for women called "A Woman's Century." Beginning in 1898, through her regular column, she established Pauline Periwinkle as an influential voice in Dallas and statewide. For the next twenty years, she pushed a wide variety of issues ranging from better education for young women to the need for women to stop using stuffed birds as ornaments on their hats. At one point, when the Texas Legislature began consideration of a bill regulating the length of hatpins, she gravely suggested that perhaps legislation controlling firearms might be more helpful to the safety of Texas citizens. Speaking out forcefully for change, she pushed for antiexpectoration ordinances, pure food and drug regulations, juvenile reform, and the Kessler Plan for city planning. She was especially concerned about poor children and the need to find ways to prevent delinguency.0

In some columns, she used current scientific knowledge to convince her readers that education and good health were necessary for women to produce healthy and intelligent children. She called for sensible clothing, property rights for women and other advances for women in Texas. Confronting the antagonism of men, she tried to point out the absurdities in their positions. Writing of male resentment of young women winning too many awards in higher education, she suggested the only future for young women in higher education might

hinge on females seeking suitably mediocre levels so they would not win too many honors from men.¹

Pauline Periwinkle attempted to inculcate civic responsibility of all kinds in women. She waged a long campaign to convince women of the cruelty and waste involved in the use of stuffed birds on their hats. In column after column, she called on women to stop using birds and to use ostrich feathers as an alternative. She also lamented the lack of grammar in high schools, decrying increasing illiteracy among applicants for college. Another issue that involved her interest in cleanliness and hygiene was the anti-spitting crusade. She entered the fight over this issue in several articles. She also responded energetically to criticism of women's clubs. When she heard of claims that these clubs led to neglect of children, she wrote angrily of the ignorance of the men's criticism and in several column spoke of the benefits to the family of a woman who studied and learned.²

Her most passionate columns centered on issues of learning and study. She emerged as an early participant in the library drive. She also led in the drive for free kindergartens in Dallas and constantly pushed for greater educational opportunities for young women. She advocated the establishment for juvenile courts and helped lead the charge for parks and playgrounds for children in Dallas. She was also a constant advocate of a cleaner city, pure food and unpolluted water.³

Periwinkle always enjoyed the support of George Dealey and the newspaper. Why did Dealey support such an outspoken advocate of women and children in a city that was so socially conservative? She and the other women always presented themselves as municipal housekeepers, bearers of culture and civilizers in order to fit societal expectations. In reality, these women acted an enthusiastic boosters and salespeople of Dallas with the same enthusiasm evinced by their husbands. While often unstated, at times these goals of boosterism emerged clearly as when Pauline Periwinkle stated that the efforts of women to institute reforms not only aimed at promoting good citizenship but also at "building a newer, better Dallas."⁴ As she urged reforms, she constantly stated that these efforts would improve the city and make it more attractive to new residents and businessmen. When the council resisted women's efforts to get city funding for different programs, she scolded them with blunt language. In the drive to clean up the city, she said in her column that "the growing city, just out of village knee pants, is always complaining about poverty where you ask it to dress accordingly to the status it assays to occupy."5

In reality, women's demands for changes often sounded more radical than they actually were. Pauline Periwinkle, along with the other clubwomen in Dallas, usually reserved their compassion for white people only. While they did reach out to poor children, they also carried all the biases common to the middle-class of the day. Pauline Periwinkle blamed African-Americans in part for the problems of dirt and disorder in Dallas and stated in a column that "the Average African" was superstitious, ignorant and indifferent to health matters. If any change came to minority areas, these citizens frequently had to organize and push for reform themselves and could expect little support from middle-class women. Middle-class women and men wanted and worked for significant reforms in the city but never sought radial social changes.⁶

Dealey and businessmen like him appreciated the contributions that the women made towards improving the image of Dallas and showcasing it as a progressive, modern place. The women believed that their efforts helped Dallas improve and prosper, and businessmen supported them in many of their reforms. The Citizens Association also generally stood behind women's efforts unless the cost became too high. As long as women sought reforms that helped Dallas's image and did not entail threats to middle-class control or demand significant costs by city government, they worked easily with the power structure of the city. Often the women's actions were accepted by the city when opposed by everyone else. Told at a state party convention to "lift your skirts and step out of the dirty mire of politics never to return," a suffragist replied that we will "lift our sleeves and houseclean these conventions until they are fit places for decent men as well as women."7 Clearly Dallas helped pave the way for many reforms of the State of Texas by women.

Vol. 53

Endnotes

¹ May Guillot Potter, "The Work of Dallas Women's Clubs" *History of Greater Dallas* vol. II, 394.

² Jacquelyn Masur McElhaney, *Pauline Periwinkle and Progressive Re*form in Dallas (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1998), 13-14.

³ Joan Marie Johnson, *Southern Ladies, New Women: Race, Region, and Clubwomen in South Carolina, 1890–1930* (Tallahassee: University of Florida Press, 2004), 4. Johnson reinforces the Southern ideals evident in women's reform rhetoric which "provided a means through which South Carolina Women not only swept municipalities clean through social reform efforts but also taught themselves, their children, and the public about the meaning of Southern history." Thus, Johnson also explicates the influence which southern identity, feminine rhetoric, and activism function as a whole. Although Johnson's book focuses on South Carolina, the culture of the south she explores mimics that of Dallas and North Texas.

⁴Paul S. Boyer, Urban Masses and Moral Order in America, 1820-1920 (Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press, 1978), 124, 128, 146-150, 169-170; Karen J. Blair with a preface by Annette K. Baxter, The Clubwoman as Feminist: True Womanbood Redefined, 1868-1914 (New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, Inc., 1980), 8, 12-16; Mary P. Ryan, Women in Public: Between Banners and Ballots, 1825-1880 (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990), 14.

⁵ Anastatia Sims, The Power of Femininity in the New South: Women's Organizations and Politics in North Carolina, 1880-1930 (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1997), 1. Elaine S. Abelson, When Ladies Go A-Thieving: Middle-Class Shoplifters in the Victorian Department Store (New York: Oxford University Press, 1989), 5-6, 16; Women in Public, 16-17.

⁶ Ronald W. Hogeland, "Coeducation of the Sexes at Oberlin College: A Study of Social Ideas in Mid-Nineteenth Century American," *Journal of Social History* 6 (1972/1973): 167; Megan Seaholm, "Earnest Women: The White Woman's Club Movement in Progressive Era Texas, 1880-1920" (PhD dissertation, Rice University, 1988), 27-29.

⁷ The Power of Femininity in the New South, xi. Sims recalls that during this time "that while all ladies were women, not all women were ladies." Judith N. McArthur, Creating the New Woman: The Rise of Southern Women's Progressive Culture in Texas, 1893-1918 (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1998), 78: Theodora Penny Martin, The Sound of Our Own Voices: Women's Study Clubs, 1860-1910 (Boston: Beacon Press, 1987) 26-27; "Earnest Women," 42-43.

⁸ Frances Hazmark, "The Southern Religious Press and the Social Gospel Movement, 1910-1915," (MA thesis, Lamar University, 1979), 82-84; Jeanne Boydston, Mary Kelley, and Anne Margolis, *The Limits of Sisterhood: The Beecher Sisters on Women's Rights and Woman's Sphere* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1988) 4-5; *The Sound of Our Own Voices*, 28-29; Anne Firor Scott, *The Southern Lady: From Pedestal to Politics*, *1830–1930* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1970), 140, 158, 161; *Earnest Women*, 13; Elizabeth Hayes Turner, "Women's Culture and Community: Religion and Reform in Galveston,' 1880-1920" (PhD dissertation, Rice University, 1990), 5; Mattie Lloyd Wooten, "The Status of Women in Texas" (PhD dissertation, University of Texas, 1941), 246, 249.

⁹ Ellen Fitzpatrick, *Endless Crusade: Women Social Scientists and Progres*sive Reform (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), 8-9, 26; *Limits of Sisterbood*, 4-5; *Sound of Our Own Voices*, 36, 37, 43-44.

¹⁰ Sophonisba Preston Breckinridge, *Women in the Twentieth Century: A Study of Their Political, Social and Economic Activities* (New York and London: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1933), 3-5, 11, 26; Jill Conway, "Women Reformers and American Culture, 1870-1930," *Journal of Social History* 5: 166-168, 174; Jane Cunningham Croly, *The History of the Woman's Club Movement in America* (New York: H. G. Allen and Co., 1898), 15-16; "Women's Culture and Community," 452.

¹¹ Sound of Our Own Voices, 67; "Women's Culture and Community," 274-275; "Earnest Women," 94, 220.

¹² "Earnest Women," 84, 91, 220; *Sound of Our Voices*, 65; "Women's Culture and Community," 274; *DMN*, October, 10, 1898.

13 Sound of Our Own Voices, 70.

¹⁴ "Earnest Women," 90,97-98; "Women's Culture and Community," 11; Sound of Our Own Voices, 70, 79-81.

¹⁵ The Power of Femininity in the New South, 3. "When North Carolina women translated private domesticity into public housekeeping they contributed to a redefinition of the proper role of government."; *Clubwoman as Feminist*, 88-90, 93, 97; "Women's Culture and Community," 273, 277; Sound of Our OwnVoices, 84, 118-119, 173; "Earnest Women," 86, 93, 117-119.

¹⁶ Margaret Nell Price, "The Development of Leadership by Southern Women Through Clubs and Organizations," (MA thesis, University or North Carolina, 1945), 159, 162; Marian Day Mullins, compiler, *A History of the Woman's Club of Fort Worth*, 1923–1973 (Fort Worth: Evans Press, 1973), 85, 88, 105; "Women's Culture and Community," 278, "Earnest Women" 207-208, 218-222, 228.

¹⁷ Emma Louise Moyer Jackson, "Petticoat Politics: Political Activism Among Texas Women in the 1920's" (PhD dissertation, University of Texas, 1980), 2, Judith N. McArthur, "Saving the Children: The Women's Crusade Against Child Labor, 1902-1918," *Women and Texas History: Selected Essays* Fane Downs and Nancy Baker Jones, eds., with a keynote essay by Elizabeth Fox-Genovese (Austin: Texas State Historical Association, 1993): 59-60; Mary Ritter Beard, *Women's Work in Municipalities* (New York and London: D. Appleton and Co., 1916), vii, 43; "Women's Culture and Community," 258, 278; *The Woman's Club of Fort Worth*, 107.

¹⁸ Elizabeth York Enstam, *Women and the Creation of Urban Life: Dallas, Texas, 1843–1920* (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1998), xix.

¹⁹ "The Development of Leadership," 131; "Petticoat Politics," 2; *Clubwoman as Feminist*, 93, 94; "Earnest Women," 340.

²⁰ Women and the Creation of Urban Life, 99.

²¹ DMN, April 8,1898; "Petticoat Politics," 2-3; "The Development of Leadership," 131-135; Sound of Our Own Voices, 53; A History of the Woman's Club Movement, 1095; "Earnest Women," 340-343.

²² Members of the Past Presidents' Association of the Dallas Federation of Women's Clubs, eds., *History of the Dallas Federation of Women's Clubs*, 1898-1936 (Dallas: Clyde C. Cockrell and Son, Publishers, 1936), 1,4, 15-16; DMN, April 8, 1898, November 22, 1903; *The History of the Woman's Club* Movement, 1095-1096; Elizabeth York Enstam, "They Called It Motherhood" Hidden Histories of Women in the New South, Virginia Bernhard, Betty Brandon, Elizabeth Fox-Genovese, Theda Perdue, Elizabeth Hayes Turner, eds. (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1994): 72.

²³ History of the Dallas Federation, 4, 16; City Minutes, Vol. 25, 71; Jacquelyn McElhaney, "Pauline Periwinkle: Prodding Dallas into the Progressive Era" Women and Texas History: 42, 46.

²⁴ DMN January 7, 1899; March 7, 1899; Dallas Daily Times Herald, September 17, 1899; Annual Reports of the City of Dallas, 1907-1908, 159; Dallas Rediscovered, 82-83; "Pauline Periwinkle," 46; "Earnest Women," 273.

²⁵ DMN, March 13, 1903.

²⁶ DMN, May 6, 1899.

²⁷ DMN, May 19, 1899; "Pauline Periwinkle," 48.

28 City Minutes, Series 1, vol. 28, 153, 214; Series 2, vol. 2, 9, vol. 4,

491(in this last instance, the petition came from the Dallas Home Garden Association rather than the Federation); "They called It Motherhood," 80.

²⁹ History of the Dallas Federation, 33; "Pauline Periwinkle," 49; "Earnest Women," 296-297; "They Called It Motherhood," 79, 81.

³⁰ City Minutes, vol. 2, 159, 160; History of the Dallas Federation, 36; Annual Report of the City of Dallas, 1906; DMN, July 31, 1905; Women's Work in Municipalities, 60; "Pauline Periwinkle," 51; "They Called It Motherhood," 83.

³¹ City Minutes, vol. 4, 417, vol. 5, 639; Women's Work in Municipalities, 146.

³² History of the Dallas Federation, 11; Dallas Daily Times Herald September 13, 1899; Women's Work in Municipalities, 148; "Pauline Periwinkle," 48, 50; "They Called It Motherhood," 81, 84; Women and the Creation of Urban Life, 153.

³³ History of the Dallas Federation, 53; Women's Work in Municipalities, 136-139; "Earnest Women," 295-297, "Pauline Periwinkle," 49-50; "They Called It Motherhood," 86.

³⁴DMN, March 9, 1908, March 25, 1908; Women's Work in Municipalities, 39, History of the Dallas Federation, 61,77.

³⁵ Women and the Creation of Urban Life, 136.

³⁶DMN, March 24, 1908, March 24, 1908, March 25, 1908; April 2, 1908; "They Called It Motherhood," 87, Women's Work in Municipalities, 190; History of the Dallas Federation, 61-62.

³⁷ *DMN*, March 24, 1908, March 23, 1908; April 2, 1908, April 5, 1908, April 6, 1908, "They Called It Motherhood," 87-88.

³⁸ DMN, March 31, 1908; April 2, 1908, April 8, 1908; *City Minutes*, vol. 2, 151; *History of the Dallas Federation*, 159-162; "Earnest Women," 292.

³⁹ "Pauline Periwinkle," 43-44; History of the Dallas Federation, 39, 41, 43.

⁴⁰ Jacquelyn Masur McElhaney, *Pauline Periwinkle and Progressive Reform in Dallas*, (College Station: Texas University Press, 1998),7. Periwinkle was also one of the first women to address gendered rhetoric in politics. In 1897 in response to the argument that women ought to keep silent in church and not "meddle" in politics, she replied with 2 Kings 21:13: "and I will wipe Jerusalem as a man wipeth a dish, wiping it and turning it upside down." *DMN*, October, 24, 1898; November 21, 1898; March 13, 1899,

March 20, 1899; March 17, 1913; "Pauline Periwinkle," 48, 49, 51; History of the Dallas Federation, 44

⁴¹ History of the Dallas Federation, 43, 47; DMN, April 4, 1898; May 16, 1898; October 7, 1901; "Pauline Periwinkle," 47.

⁴² *DMN*, May 16, 1898; October 3, 1898, October 17, 1898; November 7, 1898; December 5, 1898; April 3, 1899.

⁴³ *History of the Dallas Federation*, 39, 43, 46-47; "Pauline Periwinkle," 55; *DMN*, April 11, 1898; November 7, 1898; March 13, 1899, March 27, 1899; April 17, 1899; January 5, 1903; February 2, 1903; January 5, 1903; March 7, 1908, March 16, 1908.

44DMN, January 5, 1903.

⁴⁵ *DMN* March 16, 1908; "They Called It Motherhood; Linda Pritchard, "Community, Women and Religion on the Nineteenth Century U.S. Frontier," paper presented at the Comparative Frontier Symposium, San Antonio, Texas, November 3-5, 1995.

⁴⁶*DMN*, March 2, 1908; "They Called It Motherhood," 82, 94; "Pauline Periwinkle," 55, 56.

⁴⁷ Women and the Creation of Urban Life, 157.